IDEOLOGICAL TENDENCIES INSIDE THREE SELECTED WESTERN MEDIA ON HAGIA SOPHIA ISSUE

SUSWANTO ISMADI MEGAH S. 1, INDRA WIJAYA 2, RITA NOVITA 3, ASEP NURJAMIN 4, IMELDA YANCE 5

1. Universitas Riau Kepulauan, Batam - Indonesia
2. Bina Insani University, Bekasi, Indonesia
3, 5. Badan Riset dan Inovasi Nasional, Indonesia
4. Indonesian Institute of Education Garut, Indonesia

Corresponding author: meghah76@yahoo.co.id

Abstract— This study investigated the three selected western media that concerned on Hagia Sophia issue. The main objective of this research attempt to figure out ideological tendencies inside the articles of the three selected western media. This research utilized a descriptive - qualitative method to analyze on the ‘hot’ issue of Hagia Sophia by investigating the positive and negative of attitudinal types of their ideological tendencies of the three selected western media of their news published online. By adopting the theory based on Martin’s theory (2005) a fairly new extension in the area of Systemic Functional Linguistics (SFL) which provides a analyze This theory supplies Instrumental analysis of texts for building writers/speakers’ propositions to describe their semantic interpersonal meanings inside their texts published. The research found 18 affectual types, 15 judgmental types and 3 appreciation types. This research utilized the online newspapers of the three selected western media as the research data. The findings showed that that positive and negative attitude of study reveal that three sub-systems of language appraisal Affect found 18 data (50%) exceeded the two others. The inscribed and positive exceeded the invoked and the negative attitude. The ideological tendencies of the three selected western media showed that Affect category most frequently used by western media and some of newspaper statements which indicate that their views or ideologies to protest the policy to regain Hagia Sophia as a mosque. to regain the Hagia Sophia belongs to the world’s heritage not belonged by the Muslims or Turkey people only.

Keywords— Appraisal System, Ideology, Media, and Hagia Sophia

Table of Contents

Introduction

1. PROBLEM
2. RESEARCH METHOD
3. DISCUSSION
CONCLUSION
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

INTRODUCTION

The problem faced by the Turkey government, particularly President Erdogan when he announced Hagia Sophia as mosque. He regained the function of the Hagia Sophia as main function as applied in the Ottoman era. Then strong reaction from Western countries mediated by their media. This issue has been caught the awareness and the attention of many researchers recently.

Media is a utility to provides more effectively distribution of information and can go through everything to make it easier for us to understand it. Media are all modes and platforms used to transmit messages or data (AECT in Arsyad, 2011). According to Arsyad (2002:4) that the Media are all types of intermediaries used by people to transmit or distribute the concept, ideas, or opinions so that it was conveyed to the recipient's intended recipients by ideas, ideas or opinions. Media can be in the form of sentences, books, articles, photos contains any number of visual, musical, television show, speech or Newspaper.

Newspaper is a main tool in the mass communication that provides us with most recent news
knowledge of outside world affairs, problems and characters that are evolving. While it may be interesting, or even thrilling. According to Lynch & Pear (2002, p.7) the newspaper consists of numerous types of material, including posts, advertising, listings and graphics, as a means to inspire those who are well educated. A newspaper targets a broad number of general readers and is mainly a medium for topical news and information. For this analysis the writer will use the three western media are The Moscow Time, The New York Times, and The Guardian Newspaper.

Hagia Sophia is a building that has a very long historical story from the era of the Ottoman Turks to the present, where the building has alternated into the political roles of various countries, so it's no wonder some countries have strongly criticized the President of Turkey for not turning Hagia Sophia into the previous mosque is a museum. According to Bethan McKernan (Friday 10th July 2020 16:18 pm) in The Guardian Newspaper, Ecumenical Patriarch Bartholomew, the spiritual head of some 300 million Orthodox Christians worldwide and based in Istanbul, as saying turning it into a mosque would disappoint Christians and would “break” East and West and US Secretary of State Mike Pompeo and the Greek government also urged Turkey to turn the building into a museum. From the snippets of news, we know that every country has an identity, as well as a history that influences it and one of them is ideology.

Ideology is considered a set of belief in which it will provide trust by people to use to describe systematic beliefs and beliefs in general, which means that ideology has an important role in relation to power, both power, general groups and the power of certain groups. According to Thomson (1990: 4) Ideology is related to the legitimacy of a dominant social class or category, and learning it requires several ways and to maintain the domination relationship also uses language.

Through language is a tool that is widely used for human communicate with other individuals in the world. For us to build a connection, language is very important to us, so that communication can be more efficient. The meaning of different terms is called language. According to Matthiessen et al (2010, p. 242) Communication may occur if the use of language requires human contact. Language is one of the media or instruments for transmitting a message required to connect with other people.

The Appraisal is linked to evaluate people’s feeling and attitude to analyze text. This theory is obtained from M.A.K Halliday’s theory of Systemic Functional Linguistics (SFL), linguistics was developed by M.A.K. Halliday (Martin and White, 2005). Language has two principal dimensions, structural and functional, in the view of systemic functional linguistics. Santosa (2011) indicates that language has a mechanism that operates systematically, from lower structures, phonology/graphology, to higher systems, lexico-grammar, semantics, discourse, and text structure, both hierarchically and systemically. It is not possible to distinguish each level since each level is an organism that has an interrelated role in the realization of a discourse's holistic meaning. Then Santosa (2011:1) adds that language is used functionally to communicate a goal or role of social processes in a situation and cultural context. Each language level has its own purpose in order to achieve social goals.

SFL is considered a metafunction as a source of meaning. Three types of metafunctions are divided, namely: ideational metafunctions, interpersonal metafunctions and textual metafunctions. According to Halliday (2005) there are 3 metafunctions, both oral, in language Written in relation to their use, namely, Ideational value (comprising of Logical and experimental), interpersonal meaning, and textual meaning. Such ideational, interpersonal and textual meta-functions, such as a continuum of various colors. Have distinctions, but complement each other. Ideational meta-functions are known to grasp, coordinate and communicate our understanding of our own consciousness and the universe as a language. The metafunction that reflects the attitude and judgment of the speaker is an interpersonal metafunction. Metafunction is therefore the foundation for testing the theory of the entire business.

Based on the Appraisal theory that the language is utilized to take a position in interpersonal communication that is to evaluate, to argue, to present points of view, to react, and to express attitudes. According to Martin and Rose (2003) appraisal are used to establish social relationships between individuals and others, by providing information to listeners or readers about how our verbal feelings about things and people, both in speech and in writing. Appraisal can be used in several opinion column texts to show the researcher’s ideological intentions inside their newspaper texts.
1. PROBLEM

Hagia Sophia was hot issued launched by the western Media toward Erdogan’s government that revitalized the main function the historical mosque, this research was carried out to answer the problem of the revitalization the Hagia Sophia in the mirror of the three Western media.

2. RESEARCH METHOD

This study utilized a descriptive qualitative research method to analyze ideological intentions of the three western media on Hagia Sophia Issue. Creswell (2009, p. 4) that qualitative analysis is a way of examining and recognizing the nature of a social or human issue that individuals or groups disagree with. This theory (Appraisal system) is not a relatively new way to analyze ideology behind the texts. literary works. This theory has been utilized adopted by some previous researchers such as Alsina, Espunya & Naro, 2017; Dong and Lin, 2018; Alsanafi & Mohd Noor, 2018). The Appraisal is linked to appraise emotions, feelings, and attitudes that any text may express (Alsanafi et al, 2019). According to Martin and White (2005) appraisal framework is a new derived theory from M.A.K Halliday Systemic Functional Linguistics. An appraisal is “the subjective presence of writers/speakers in texts as they adopt stances towards both the material they present and those with whom they communicate” (Martin & White 2005, p.14). This theory provides some elements to build writers/speakers’ propositions so as to convey their semantic interpersonal meanings ((Alsanafi et al, 2019, p.65). The data were collected by accessing the latest information through online media (Rangkuti et al., 2023, p.3 ). This research utilized media texts as the main data to be analyzed based on the Appraisal theory, particularly attitudinal types to investigate hidden ideologies inside the three Western media on Hagia Sophia issue. After obtaining the data, then the researchers analyzed the data based the appraisal theory. The researchers analyzes in term of attitudinal types. As stated by Alsanafi and Noor (2019) that attitudinal types is the main type in the appraisal theory. Noor (2015) highlights that Appraisal framework involves three major categories: Attitude (the assessing people, things, and actions), Engagement (the position of the writers/speakers with their readers/hearers, supported by the content given), and finally, the third category is Graduation which is connected with 'up-scaling' or 'down-scaling' the previous two sources (attitude and engagement).

3. DISCUSSION

Attitudinal analysis involves certain resources or linguistic items of the three Western Media texts. This research deals with the statistical data sets of the attitudinal types, including the occurrences of; (Judgment, Appreciation, Affect). The results are offered in Tables which involve a comprehensive explanation of all the attitudinal resources and the percentages of each system (Alsanfi and Noor, 2019. We may make a comparison among the three media by using attitudinal systems in order to open ideological intentions of the three Selected-Western Media.

The discussion which was based on the data found using Martin’s theory of attitude. This research utilized the data in the articles published by the three online Western Media On “Hagia Sophia Issue”. The data of this study used the transcript of newspaper texts. From the data have been analyzed, the researcher find that Three Western Media uses appraisal system by Martin’s theory of attitude (2005). The context below presents the number of occurrences of the attitude used by Three Western Media On “Hagia Sophia Issue”. Therefore, the data found in this study can be divided into some attitudinal types, namely positive and negative affect, positive and negative judgment, positive and negative appreciation. To use percentage or total number here is not quantitative data analysis but the percentage of the occurrences will be used to understand what are most frequency of attitude used by News Paper from Three Western Media text. Furthermore, the researcher firstly analyzes the attitude in Three Western Media on Hagia Sophia Issue. The result of analysis can be seen from percentage table below:
As can be seen on the table 1 above, that the positive of the subtype of Attitude shows 36 instances of Affect (50%) with 5 data of positive polarity, and 13 data of negative polarity. This Table also shows 15 instances of Judgement (41,67%) with 14 data of positive polarity, and 1 data of negative polarity, and shows 3 instances of Appreciation (8,33%) with 3 data of positive polarity, and 0 data of negative polarity.

Based on the table 1 above the types of attitudinal categories that is most commonly found is Affect with 18 data or 50%, Judgment is in second position with total data of 15 or 41,67% and the last is Appreciation with 3 data or 8,33%.

From the table 1 above the judgment section is more dominant which shows that sources from several newspapers strongly criticized the actions of the Turkish president who turned Hagia Sophia into a place of worship, and from this we know that social sanctions are very clearly shown to readers, then the part of the affect that is more dominant than the several parts of the affect, namely happiness, unhappiness, security, insecurity, satisfaction, and dissatisfaction that only insecurity as more and more emphasis. According to Martin and White (2005, p. 49) The final variable in our typology of affect groups emotions into three major sets having to do with un/happiness, in/security and dis/ satisfaction.

From table 1 above also shows a lot of affect variables, why? after further research and based on repeated research from 3 different western media through newspapers we found that every sentence is more worried about the Turkish president's policy of turning Hagia Sophia into a mosque again.

Furthermore, the findings of the dominant appraisal system were used by affect in three western media, so it can be seen in the table 2 as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TYPES</th>
<th>POLARITY</th>
<th>STRATEGY</th>
<th>FREQUENCY</th>
<th>PERCENTAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Positive</td>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>Inscribed</td>
<td>Invoked</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Happiness</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unhappiness</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Security</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Insecurity</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Satisfaction</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dissatisfaction</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inclination</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dissinclination</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>18</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

From the finding above. It can be seen that there are the positive of the subtype of affect shows
18 instances of happiness (16.67%) with 3 data of positive polarity, and 0 data of negative polarity. This Table also shows 2 instances of security (11.12%) with 2 data of positive polarity, and 0 data of negative polarity, and shows 13 instances of insecurity (72.21%) with 0 data of positive polarity and 13 data of negative polarity, and shows 0 instances of dissatisfaction (0%) with 0 data of positive polarity and 0 data of negative polarity. While strategies used, invoked type with 14 (77.7%) instances exceeded the inscribed type with only 4 (22.3%) instances.

Based on the table 2 above the types of affect that is most commonly found are insecurity with 13 data or 72.21%, happiness are in second position with total data of 3 or 16.67%. Furthermore, the researchers will present example and the explanation of each appraisal system from attitudinal types. This section will discuss or analyze every clause used by Martin’s Theory. In this research, the categories the data of every sentence by using appraisal analyze. Some findings of each appraisal system from attitude found explained as following extracts below:

**Extract 1**

“We want back what already belonged to us,” Mr. Gulerce wrote. “We want back what was cut off from our history, faith, culture, national dignity, state honor.” (Line 115, The New York Time).

As can be seen in the Extract 1 above, Mr Gulerce State in his writings. There is word “want back”. In other words, this shows the statement of Mr. Gulerce told the Turkish people that they would not give up to restore what was cut off from their history, beliefs, culture, national dignity, honor of their country for the good and ideals of their nation. So, this affect includes positive happiness category. The Turkish people were very happy to hear Mr. Gulerce’s statement that showed the identity of his nation and its dignity.

**Extract 2**

Hagia Sophia, the common heritage of humanity, will go forward to embrace everyone with its new status in a much more sincere and much more unique way,” he said in a live television address. (Line 33, The New York Times).

As can be seen in the Extract 2 above that President in his speech expressed “embrace” for everyone with the status of Hagia Sophia. Meaning of word embrace to show his feeling happy. So word embrace it shows its means President Erdogan is feeling Happiness. So, this affect include positive happiness category. The Turkish people feels embraced and protected by their leader and that makes them happy.

**Extract 3**

Members of his ruling Justice and Development party (AKP) greeted the decree with a standing ovation in parliament, and the call to prayer was recited from the building’s minarets on Friday afternoon while supporters celebrated outside. (Line 10, The Guardian).

As can be seen in the Extract 3 above that Members of Government greeted the decree with a standing ovation in parliament. " Conveys confidence which is positive affect is categorized into “security”. It shows feeling of security and believe about accountability for Government to the Turkies people.

**Extract 4**

In its own statement on Friday, UNESCO said that Hagia Sophia is inscribed on its world heritage list as a museum which binds the Turkish state to ensure that “no modification is made to the outstanding universal value of the property. The organization added that communities and others concerned with the property should be ensured inclusive and equitable access to the monument. (Line 91, The New York Times).

As can be seen in the Extract 4 above that the utterances UNESCO by using the word “should be ensured”. Conveys confidence which is positive affect is categorized into “security”. It shows a sense of security and trust about the will of the community or other parties to have access to the monument.

**Extract 5**

In a post on Twitter that included a copy of the decree, Mr. Erdogan simply wrote “Hayırlı olsun,” or “Congratulations”. (Line 21, The New York Times).

As can be seen in the Extract 5 above that his post on twitter there is word “Congratulations".
Erdogan shows his positively feel how great the sacrifice made by him for their nation Turkey. So, this is a positive affect especially to positive happiness category. The Turkish people are happy with the Turkish leader's congratulations to his people and shows his empathy towards them.

Extract 6
Verhinin's statement came after the Russian Orthodox Church expressed dismay at Turkey's decision. "The concern of millions of Christians were not heard," Church spokesman Vladimir Legolda said on Friday. (Line 13, The Moscow Time).

As can be seen in the Extract 2 above shows of Verhinin’s statement in his speech to Turkey. In his speech there is word dismay. It means that there are worries and anxieties with Turkey's decision,. So this shows a negative feeling that belongs to the category of insecurity. The word dismay shows the Russian Orthodox Church's disappointment with Turkey's decision to turn Hagia Sophia into a place of worship for Muslims.

Extract 7
Conservationists and art historians have raised concerns about what will happen to the medieval mosaics inside Hagia Sophia, which depict the Holy Family and portraits of imperial Christian emperors, which strict Muslims may demand be covered. Tour guides said that the building may be closed to tourists during prayer times, or even that parts of the building be sectioned off to non-Muslims. (Line 45, The New York Time).

The Extract 7 above shows that conservationists and art historians has voiced to the medieval mosaics inside Hagia Sophia. In his speech there is word have raised concerns. It means that there is a sense of worry and anxiety with the change of Hagia Sophia to become a Muslim worship. So this shows a negative feeling that belongs to the category of insecurity. It is conservationists and art historians were concerned about the cover of the imperial Christian emperor's mosaic inside the Hagia Sophia.

Extract 8
Turkey's move followed a court decision last week revoking the museum status of the UNESCO World Heritage site, and has triggered a global outcry. (Line 4, The Moscow Time).

The Extract 8 above shows that there is word “global outcry" in his statement. It means that Turkey has received strong criticism and strong protests from the world because it received the revocation of the world heritage from UNESCO. So this shows a negative feeling that belongs to the category of insecurity. Turkey accepts the removal of Hagia Sophia from UNESCO's world heritage site.

Extract 9
Josep Borrell, the European Union’s senior diplomat, called Turkey's decision regrettable. (Line 87, The New York Time).

Based on the Extract 9 above that Josep Borrell convey his statement to Turkey's Government. In his speech there is word regrettable. So, this regrettable word shows the impact of negative feelings on Turkey's decision. So, it shows insecurity. The decision made by Turkey worried European Union diplomats, so it was regretted by him.

Extract 10
Last month the US secretary of state, Mike Pompeo, said any change would diminish the Hagia Sophia’s ability “to serve humanity as a much-needed bridge between those of differing faith, traditions and cultures". (Line 51, The New York Time).

As can be seen in the Extract 10 above that There is word diminish. This means that it is inconvenient to do. So he felt uncomfortable with the changes in Hagia Sophia. So, this is included in the negative Insecurity category. Showing impact is not good and will lead to making changes that damage Hagia Sophia.

Extract 11
Ecumenical Patriarch Bartholomew, the spiritual head of 300 million Orthodox Christians, warned before the ruling that altering the status of the building would fracture the eastern and western worlds. Russia’s Orthodox Church said turning it into a mosque was “unacceptable”. (Line 50, The New York Time).

Based on the Extract 11 data above shows that there is word unacceptable. This means that is a
show of dislike. So that it can be said that he cannot accept the change of Hagia Sophia into a place of worship. So, this is included in the negative insecurity category. The spiritual head of 300 million Orthodox Christians had warned that the decision could drive a wedge between west and east and his decision was unacceptable.

**Extract 12**
Huseyin Gulerce, a pro-government columnist for the Star newspaper reprinted a column he had written 30 years ago in which he had criticized the conversion of Hagia Sophia into a museum as an unnecessary gesture of deference to the West that cast a “dark shadow” over Turkish independence. (Line 111, The New York Time)

Based on the Extract 12 above shows that Huseyn Gulerce said in his writings. There is the word “had criticized”. That is, this shows his criticism of the change of Hagia Sophia into a museum several years ago. So, this is including into the negative insecurity category. Why to be negative insecurity, Huseyn Gulerce’s criticism has created a sense of insecurity due to his statement that the conversion of Hagia Sophia into a museum was an unnecessary tribute to the West.

**Extract 13**
Opening this place to worship will not make Hagia Sophia lose anything from its world heritage identity,” he said in an interview with Anadolu agency. (Line 101, The New York Time, see appendix 3)

Based on the Extract 13 above, Ibrahim Kalin convey his speech. In his speech here is word “will not”. In other words, this shows Ibrahim Kalin’s statement towards people that they will not lose their status as their world heritage identity. So, this affect include negative insecure category. His decision to turn Hagia Sophia into a Muslim place of worship will not lose its identity as world heritage.

**Extract 14**
In the run up to the court’s decision, Ankara’s international allies and foes alike criticized the impending move. (Line 36, The Guardian)

The Extract 12 above shows there is word criticized. It’s mean that Ankara’s international allies and foes state disagree with the court’s decision. So, this affect include negative insecurity category. The international Ankara and its allies strongly criticized the decision of the Turkish leader.

**Extract 15**
The Greek culture minister, Lina Mendoni, called the decision an “open provocation to the civilised world” in a statement on Friday. “Hagia Sophia, located on Turkey’s territory, in Istanbul, is a monument to all mankind, regardless of religion. The nationalism shown by President Erdoğan leads his country back six centuries,” she said. (Line 39, The Guardian)

Based on the Extract 15 above shows that in his speech there is word “provocation”. This shows an invitation to the world to provoke an Erdogan statement that changes the world’s view of Hagia Sophia. So this is a negative affect include in negative insecurity category. The decision of the Turkish leader who made an open provocation to all countries according to the statement of the Greek minister of culture.

**Extract 16**
Cyprus’s foreign minister, Nikos Christodoulides, wrote on Twitter that Cyprus “strongly condemns Turkey’s actions on Hagia Sophia in its effort to distract domestic opinion and calls on Turkey to respect its international obligations”. (Line 45, The Guardian)

The Extract 16 above shows in his writings there word “strongly condemns”. This shows an invitation to the world to strongly prohibit Turkey’s actions in the Hagia Sophia in its attempt to divert global opinion and calls on Turkey to respect its international obligations.” So this is a negative affect include in insecurity invoked category. The Cyprus foreign minister strongly disliked the actions of the Turkish leader who obliged his people to obey his rules.

**Extract 17**
The Greek Foreign Ministry denounced the conversion as unacceptable and a breach of Hagia Sophia’s status as part of a UNESCO World Heritage site. (Line 80, The New York Time).

The Extract 16 above shows that in his statement there word “denounced”. This shows demonstrated his desire to criticize the unacceptable changes and invalidate Hagia Sophia’s status as
part of the UNESCO World Heritage site." So this is a negative affect include in negative insecurity invoked category. It is strongly criticized and disliked by the Greek foreign ministry for the decision of the leader of Turkey, which is a world heritage.

Extract 18

In a strongly worded statement, the Greek culture minister, Lina Mendoni, condemned Turkey’s decision as a “direct challenge to the entire civilized world,” adding that Mr. Erdogan’s nationalism had pushed the country back six centuries. (Line 83, The New York Time)

Based on the Extract 18 above shows that the statement contained the words “condemned Turkey's decision”. This shows a strong concern about Turkey's decisions that have pushed the country back six centuries.” So this is a negative assessment that falls into the category of negative insecurity. The Greek culture minister was worried and very threatening about the Turkish leader's decision and also stated that Turkish nationalism was very backward to past events.

CONCLUSION

By utilizing attitudinal theories of the Martin and white (2005) to investigate ideological tendencies inside the Three Selected Western online Media On “Hagia Sophia” Issue. This research was analyzed through attitudinal categories of the texts of those media to answer the problems statements. The findings show that the three selected western online media such as: The Guardian Newspaper, New York Time Newspaper, The Moscow Time. The researchers will conclude the answers of the data findings and analysis. This research found that 18 data of Affect, 15 data of Judgement, 3 data of Appreciation. The findings of study reveal that three sub-systems of language appraisal (affect, judgment, and appreciation) are used to refer to newspaper media. Three western media: The Guardian Newspaper, New York Time Newspaper, The Moscow Time to be data sources to show language assessment attitudes in three newspapers from each country. Affect consists of 18 (50%), Judgment 15 (41,67%), and Appreciation 3 (8,33%). (a). Affect consist of positive 5 data, negative 13 data, (b). Judgment consists of positive 14 data, negative 1 data, (c). Appreciation consist of positive 3 data, negative 0 data. This research concludes the three selected online newspapers of the western media finds some statements from the three media which indicates their views or ideological tendencies such as violent protests with statements and changes to Hagia Sophia into a place of worship and eliminating world’s heritage of positive 3 data, negative 0 data. Therefore, ideologies inside the three western media mean to protest and to regain the Hagia Sophia belongs to the world’s heritage not belonged by the Muslims or Turkey people only.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

Our special thank goes to Chairman of Batam College Foundation and Rector of Riau Kepulauan for great chance to complete and to encourage us to finish this research faster. In addition, their financial support for this research as well.
REFERENCES


