RESOURCE VALUE CO-CREATION IN RETAIL: INTEGRATING SERVICE DOMINANT LOGIC OF MARKETING AND CONSUMER CULTURE THEORY

IMRAN SADIQ, DR. ABDUL WAHEED

1Assistant Professor
School of Professional Advancement
University of Management and Technology, Lahore Pakistan
imran.sadiq@umt.edu.pk

2Assistant Professor
Dr Hasan Murad School of Management
University of Management and Technology, Lahore Pakistan
abdul_waheed@umt.edu.pk

Abstract

To establish the framework for the research of the value co-creation process in the retail sector, the study merges the Service Dominant Logic of Marketing (S-DL) and Consumer Culture Theory (CCT). S-DL is widely adopted, criticized, developed, and coupled with many disciplines on a global scale. This logic heavily relies on the concept of value co-creation (VCoC), which outlines the overarching objective of marketing interactions and partnerships. S-DL offers a framework for actors' actions and reactions when they collaborate to integrate resources with the intention of creating experiences. Further, thirty-eight interviews were conducted to find out the type of resources that are part of cocreated retail process. The study found out two main resources hard skills and soft skills. The largest frequencies scored was by soft skills. Further, hard skills got four sub themes. They are availability of the stock and on logging it on e-live, smooth operations, marketing research, evaluation and comparison with other brands, and good understanding and knowledge about the products they are selling. However, soft skills depicted thirteen sub themes. They are selling, vision, see the picture in long term, innovative people, adaptable, fresh ideas and new way of doing things, communication, build relation, judge the psychology of customer, creating value, experience to co-create value, try to build a good relationship, and honesty and integrity.

INTRODUCTION

The Goods Dominant (GD) logic, which was primarily concerned with manufacturing, was replaced by the Service Dominant (S-DL) logic in daily microeconomics (Becker and Jaakkola, 2020). According to S-DL, goods serve as means rather than as the ultimate goal in and of themselves. As a result, consider your customers as co-creators as opposed to just a means of exchanging tangible items. S-DL shifted away from the Goods-dominated "value-in-exchange" idea and towards the "value-in-use/context" approach, which leads to the co-creation of value. Value co-creation (VCoC) is a shared, communal, peer-like process that, ideally, significantly creates new value (Ramaswamy and Ozcan, 2018). The broad definition of value creation by the customer through interactions with the provider. In marketing theory, VCoC has predicted focal significance.

Researchers are increasingly drawn to SDL as a topic of study, particularly those working in the area of service marketing (Luftenegger, Comuzzi and Grefen, 2017). As well as extensive studies, investigations, and debates surrounding it, there have been continuous updates addressing what the rationale might be since mid-2004 (Tadajewski and Jones (2021). Therefore, academics affirm that S-DL should be viewed as open source and that they should continue to speculate about its component pieces (Ng and Vargo, 2018). Regarding VCoC, it has been observed that emphasis is placed on VCoC in four of the ten adjusted FPs in SDL (Hartwig, Von Saldern and Jacob, 2021).
demonstrates the distinguishable quality of VCoC in SDL. In addition to SDL, many viewpoints on marketing in the service sector, such as fundamental S-DL (Ishizuka, Kuo-Che and Kishi, 2022) and research on the science of service (Li, Peng, Xing, Zhang and Zhang, 2021), have similar perspectives on collaborative VC, further demonstrating the importance of VCoC in the writing.

According to Du and Chou (2020), VCoC is becoming the cutting edge of advertising thought and is gaining popularity as one of the most thought-provoking, paradigm-shifting, and financially feasible ideas in the industry. Advertisers are attempting to comprehend the benefits and challenges associated with remembering customers for their promotional processes (Storbacka, 2019). Along these lines, the exploration, namely the fast fashion (FF) industry, does not look into the potential complications of VCoC that incorporate customers through trade, intelligence, and cooperative effort.

Customers are currently much more creative and active since they can VCoC with businesses and other customers on their own. Through a variety of life endeavors (such as opposition to commercialization, customer strengthening, opposition, brand networks, consuming clans, etc.), they might jointly develop their very own utilization. These inventive and dynamic changes have given us a new perspective on how the VC process might bring opportunities and risks for businesses. Among intellectual and practical discussions in advertising, VC is an astonishing and fascinating topic. Despite the fact that these conversations have addressed the changing roles of consumers through a variety of research strands, they will primarily focus on consumers’ capacity or ability to address specialized or product use issues through the VC process (Kennedy & Guzman, 2017). Additionally, the focus of these talks is either on the personal or social degree of VC.

A deeper knowledge of cultural dimensions of experience is provided through CCT. Marketer and customer interactions result in value extraction. The marketplace culture (MpC) is one of the primary areas of focus in CCT research. In marketing, relationships develop as a result of interactions between marketing resources, established conventions, and culturally specific characteristics of behaviour (Tregua, Brozovic and D’Auria, 2021). The “operant factors” of CCT research concentrate on several problematic domains and reveal knowledge of “what the customer is?” and “what the customer does?” CCT does extensive research to understand how consumers divide their financial, social, and cultural resources among competing products and services and how to use them to improve their experiences. This entire theoretical approach might lead academics to establish a theory of VCoC. This study uses the S-DL paradigm to learn about the VCoC process in the context of CCT.

Theoretically, integrating CCT and S-DL is the initial step towards identifying enhanced ideas of experience. When experiences arise in a CCT context, “cultural richness” is the main focus, but S-DL’s “ecosystem” promotes value creation from multiple perspectives (Chou, Huang and Tu, 2023). Now that S-DL has shifted to an A2A (actor to actor) perspective rather than a B2C (business to customer), B2B (business to business), or C2C (customer to customer) viewpoint, there are more opportunities for cross- and sub-disciplinary research streams like CCT and S-DL, as well as opportunities across disciplines like management, supply chain, and information systems (Brodie et al., 2019).

The value creation synergy between S-DL and CCT Limelight, when integrated from various angles, influences both the ongoing progress and revolution of any given experience. Organizational links are intertwined at a very high level of integration. Numerous participants act and react to both positive and negative assessments and reassessments of experiences, continuously co-creating the multiple knitted layers (Stephan et al., 2023). In cultural context research, VCoC can likely come before the understanding of value since cultural meanings and other norms and rituals significantly influence how someone evaluates their experiences. Researchers are curious to learn how people's
choices alter over time in a larger cultural context. This will provide the researcher with more input in the cultural context of the co-creation of value (Baker and Nenonen, 2020).

There has been very little research done on the subject of service experience so far. Due to the rise in social interactions in the market, the service experience is stressed. To fully grasp and comprehend the customer-focused service experience co-creation, more theoretical and experiential study is required (Fehrer and Weiland, 2021). Marketing academics can better grasp the entire interaction process of MpC by reconciling S-DL and CCT. Vargo, Akaka and Wieland (2020) place a strong emphasis on firm resources (i.e., skills and knowledge) in S-DL when discussing interactions between businesses and customers. By including consumer resources to explain the entire trade process, Arnould et al. (2006) have expanded previous work. They combine CCT, with its focus on VCoC, and S-DL to demonstrate how businesses interact with customers’ cultural schemas in an effort to start a process in which they co-create value with (rather than for) consumers. Therefore, businesses should focus on how consumers value their set of life projects or how they carry out their plans rather than their purchasing power as a first priority.

Moreover, this gives businesses the ability to predict the values that customers will want and assist them in using VCoC (Akaka, Koskela-Huotari and Vargo, 2021). Thus, by concentrating on individual and group interaction inside FF brands, this dissertation has offered an additional perspective on VC. Additionally, there are currently no experimental studies that coordinate S-DL, VCoC, and CCT to observe how clients behave in a co-constructed MpC. The biggest gap found is that FF industry research on such integration has never been done. Therefore, the research objective of this study is to pinpoint the elements of the VCoC process in a co-created FF retail setting among resources as it is one of the actors.

RESEARCH QUESTION

- What are the types of resources that are part of Co-Created Retail Experience?

LITERATURE REVIEW

Clients are brought into the value chain via VCoC, which shifts associations’ focus from organizational-driven to client-driven interactions (Durugbo and Pawar, 2012). Associations are progressively providing VCoC opportunities to increase their own and consumers’ incentives (Durugbo and Pawar, 2014). However, little is known about how a big VCoC may affect a representative (Jaakkola and Alexander, 2014), particularly for those who have frequent client interactions (Nasution and Mavondo, 2008).

Around 20 years ago, Prahalad and Ramaswamy (2000) acknowledged that the role of the customer was evolving and offered some suggestions for how organizations may address these new consumer functions (Kennedy et al., 2022). Including that increased consumer input could result in representatives suffering emotional and mental harm (Prahalad and Ramaswamy, 2000). Since then, however, there hasn’t really been any research that looks at whether or how VCoC affects administrative staff, despite the fact that scientists have stated that understanding the effects of value for administrative staff is an important area for future research (Jaakkola and Alexander, 2014). Therefore, the purpose of this investigation is to ascertain whether value is established or pulverized by personnel working for VCoC.

While previous research has examined how the VCoC process promotes value being used for customers, little research has examined how the process affects employee incentives, focusing primarily on the satisfaction and experience of customers (Yi and Gong, 2013) or from the perspective of an organization to purposefully manage the VCoC procedure to achieve benefits for
the organization (Durugbo and Pawar, 2014). Knowing how the VCoC procedure can be figured out to enhance results from value for workers (and some other on-screen characters in the administration organize) comes from understanding the parts of the VCoC process that encourage or, on the other hand, restrain the value that might be co-made from the point of view of the workers.

S-DL

S-DL was created in 2004 as a result of Vargo and Lusch's perception of a trend in the promotion of inquiry and consideration: a focus on services and procedures rather than things and outcomes. Vargo and Lusch (2004) showed how the promotion of ideas and practices was progressing from G-DL to S-DL in their original study. The foundation of commerce, according to G-DL, is an item that combines substantial (i.e., merchandise) and immaterial (i.e., services) yields. G-DL is concerned with goods that have installed value that is created during the manufacturing process, typically apart from the consumer (Vargo and Lusch, 2008). According to G-DL, in general, suppliers create the value that is built into products, and customers purchase that value (Payne et al., 2009). In G-DL, an incentive is thought of as the exchange of one thing of value (such as money) for another (such as an item). Although society was concerned about the distribution of goods at the time this justification was developed, marketing's understanding of administration has since changed from administration as a unit of yield to support as a technique. A more customer-driven service rationale emerged in the midst of this transition, bringing substantial connotations with it (Grönroos, 1997).

In contrast to G-DL, S-DL is service driven, emphasizing impalpable assets like connections, exchange, and communication (Ballantyne, 2004) and viewing service as the fundamental tenet of trade (Lusch and Vargo, 2014). In order to distinguish S-DL from G-DL, this hypothetical point of view initially presented eight key premises (Vargo and Lusch, 2004). By advising that a good merely improves the service experience, the model essentially departs from the G-DL approach (Vargo and Lusch, 2008). This challenges the notion that consumers are disinterested and demonstrates that the customer will always be a value co-maker (Vargo and Lusch, 2004). More recently, this concept was updated to encompass the multi-on-screen character nature of co-creation, highlighting that the customer can cocreate value.

VCOC

According to Vargo and Lusch (2016), it is defined as the actions of various actors who are frequently unaware of one another but who contribute to one another's prosperity. This suggests that a recipient will always be a co-maker of significant value because value must be created with and under the control of the client (Blasco-Arcas et al., 2020). Regardless of its importance to S-DL, VCoC originates before this hypothetical system, according to Prahalad and Ramaswamy (2004). The principle of client association has been in place for many years and is linked to the four distinguishing characteristics of services. Even though the concept has only been present for around 20 years, it has received lavish discussion, with experts noting up to 27 different interpretations of significant VCoC (Bharti et al., 2015). According to some observers, the area is still in the early stages of application and will continue to evolve and develop over time (Alves et al., 2016).

VCoC is essential to the S-DL account and method. S-DL's stance on VCoC as recurring in nature. According to Vargo and Lusch (2016), it is portrayed as being represented and carried out through institutional plans, in firmly established and overarching administrative frameworks, in which on-screen actors collaborate to create value through importance-laden interactions and coordinate resources, ultimately leading to a service trade. Due to the use of the term "co-creation" in the sixth unique primary reason, they are aware that they may be partially to blame for the early debate surrounding VCoC. Co-maker was eventually changed to co-creation (Vargo and Lusch,
RUSSIAN LAW JOURNAL
Volume XI (2023) Issue 2

2008), since the term’s original developers believed that co-maker more accurately reflected a G-DL and generation-focused point of view while co-maker was more in accordance with the S-DL perspective.

Vargo and Lusch (2016) have now reemphasized the definitions of co-generation and VCoC, arguing that while value is invariably co-made, co-generation can be optional. For instance, it would be considered co-generation if customers were actively involved in the design, formulation, production, or consummation of a company’s output. However, VCoC is more comprehensive because all services involve collaboration, which results in the co-production of valuable goods. Anything that has the potential to create an incentive for the featured on-screen characters is a resource that an organization can use to make proposals of value (Wetter-Edman et al., 2014).

All social and financial on-screen characters in S-DL, such as individuals, families, businesses, nations, and so forth, are asset integrators (Vargo and Lusch, 2008). Anyone who is a part of a service ecosystem, such as customers, employees, organizations, or family groups, might be categorized as a performing artist. Resources are defined as everything that has the potential to serve as an incentive for the participating performing artists (Vargo and Lusch, 2017). According to Vargo and Lusch (2017), some assets are wild, such as operand assets (e.g., regular assets, such as the climate), while others are operant assets (e.g., learning and abilities). According to Vargo and Lusch (2016), the operant assets—i.e., assets that follow up on other assets—are the focus of the S-DL point of view.

CCT

The goal of the CCT field of request is to simplify the intricacies of buyer culture. CCT investigates the heterogeneous circulation of implications and the variety of covering social groupings that exist inside the more extensive socio-recorded casing of globalization in addition to showcasing culture as a truly heterogeneous arrangement of all in all mutual implications, lifestyles, and tying together qualities shared by an individual from society (for example, Americans share this type of culture, Japanese offer that type of culture). From a CCT perspective, CC is seen as a dynamic system of limit-traversing associations and connections with material, monetary, symbolic, and social relationships.

Instead of being a quality of character, CC is something that consumers do and tolerate. In line with this, “being a purchaser” is a personality trait for market private enterprise, our current global financial system, and the two advance and build together. The linkages between lived encounters—that is, between significant lifestyles and the iconic and material assets like brands on which they depend—are interceded by advertisers, either explicitly or indirectly, as Don (1997) posits.

A key component of this development is CCT. By deconstructing twenty years of consumer research and defining the central concepts of CCT, a collection of speculative points of view that address the dynamic relationships between customer activities, the commercial center, and social signification, Arnould and Thompson (2005) provide a fundamental commitment. Customers can access some of the tangible assets that define their personality initiatives through company sectors. Advertisements are shaped by consumer culture, and vice versa. Both individually and collectively, buyers are interpretive operators (Cova et al., 2007). They also refresh, alter, or confirm market implications relating to brands, products, and resources while improving images.

VCoC AND S-DL

Researchers are increasingly drawn to SDL as a topic of study, particularly those working in the area of services marketing (Galvagno and Dalli, 2014). As well as extensive study studies and discussions surrounding it, there have been continuous updates addressing what the explanation might be since mid-2004 (Grönroos and Gummerus, 2012). Therefore, academics affirm that SDL should be viewed...
as open source and that they should continue to speculate about its component pieces (Hollebeek et al., 2016). Regarding VCoC, it has been observed that emphasis is placed on VCoC in four of the ten adjusted FP in SDL (Vargo and Lusch, 2016). This demonstrates the distinguishable quality of VCoC in SDL.

In addition to SDL, many viewpoints on marketing in the service sector, such as fundamental S-DL (Grönroos and Gummerus, 2012) and research of the science of service (Maglio and Spohrer, 2008), have similar perspectives on collaborative VC, further demonstrating the importance of VCoC in the writing. According to Fisher and Smith (2011), VCoC is becoming the cutting edge of advertising thought and is gaining popularity as one of the most thought-provoking, paradigm-shifting, and financially feasible ideas in the industry. Advertisers are attempting to comprehend the benefits and challenges associated with remembering customers for their promotional process (Cova and Dalli, 2009).

S-DL AND CCT

The research done on CCT provides a market perspective that emphasizes the cultural diversity of the background that surrounds expertise and knowledge. Contrarily, S-DL undervalues the social and relational orientated backdrop by emphasizing the integration and utilization of a variety of measured and unquantified resources within dynamic systems of actors (Chandler & Vargo, 2011; Edvardsson, et al., 2012). According to research on CCT, S-DL offers a deeper understanding of cultural features of know-how and experience. It also provides a structure for brainstorming the process by which exposures connecting to the market are co-created through actions and collaborations between numerous stakeholders or actors (Elina Jaakkola, Dr. Leena Aarikka-Stenroos, Jaakkola, Helkkula, & Aarikka-Stenroos, 2015).

Theoretically, integrating CCT and S-DL is the initial step towards identifying enhanced idea of experience. When experiences arise in a CCT context, “cultural richness” is the main focus, but S-DL’s “ecosystem” promotes value creation and value from multiple perspectives. Now that S-DL has shifted to an A2A (actor to actor) perspective rather than a B2C (business to customer), B2B (business to business), or C2C (customer to customer) viewpoint, there are more opportunities for cross- and sub-disciplinary research streams like CCT and S-DL as well as opportunities across disciplines like management, supply chain, and information systems.

The value creation synergy between S-DL and CCT Limelight, when integrated from various angles, influences both the ongoing progress and revolution of any given experience. Organizational links are intertwined throughout a large array of organizations and their integration. Numerous participants act and react to both good and negative assessments of reassessments of experiences, continuously co-creating the multiple knitted layers (Chandler & Vargo, 2011). In cultural context research, VCoC can likely come before the understanding of value since “cultural meanings” and other norms and rituals significantly influence how someone evaluates their experiences. Researchers are curious to learn how people’s choices alter over time in a larger “cultural context.” This will provide the researcher more input in the “cultural context” co-creation of value (Elina Jaakkola, Dr. Leena Aarikka-Stenroos, Akaka, Vargo, & Schau, 2015).

In the future, theoretical and empirical research will be necessary to understand the social and cultural prospects of markets. CCT must understand how its actions impact value generation at the macro, meso, and local levels. According to Elina Jaakkola, Dr. Leena Aarikka-Stenroos, McColl-Kennedy, et al. (2015), research needs to be expanded to understand how various permutations of “operant and operand” resources are integrated and used by different actors to create value for others as well as themselves. To improve the search for resources, associations, and value co-creation among varied players like customers and organizations, more study is needed. By doing experiential research, it is possible to examine several perspectives on similar situations. One
might also consider how organizational integration may affect how context experiences form. According to Elina Jaakkola, Dr. Leena Aarikka-Stenroos, Akaka, et al. (2015), it is crucial for those working in the sector, such as managers and academicians, to comprehend the individual experience in addition to the social and “cultural context” to grasp how the experience occurs.

**RESEARCH METHODOLOGY**

According to the next viewpoint, subjectivism (also known as relativism), social marvels are created utilizing the perspectives of social on-screen characters who are concerned with their identity as individuals (Guba & Lincoln, 2005). Accordingly, the study is based on the subjectivism ontology because it is guided by a subject like the existence of people’s observations, experiences, and perceptions. Furthermore, interpretivist epistemology was used for the inquiry. The interpretivist believes in emotional analysis and is concerned with the emotions and character traits of the example they have chosen to study. They conduct research on non-evaluable data; therefore, the approach used is subject to some degree of subjectivity. Due to their changeable and unique nature, social processes require collaboration between the analyst and respondent. The goal of this analysis is to produce a more sophisticated and informed development than what was previously demonstrated.

Constructivism was the paradigm that the study examined. When using this paradigm, the researcher creates meaning using interpretivist and subjective techniques, including unique information-gathering and analysis frameworks. According to constructivists, reality is a relative concept that depends on one’s perspective. It understands the significance of the entailing introduction’s subjective nature. It is founded on the justification for creating social reality. The close collaboration between the investigator and the respondents, which allows them to tell their own stories, is one of the advantages. Through these accounts, the respondents can express their viewpoints on the outside world, enabling the analyst to more easily understand the respondents’ actions.

Additionally, the study chose an exploratory case study because it wanted to explore the VCoC phenomenon and improve the theory. Multiple case studies were also chosen for the study. It is regarded as being even more convincing, and the overall analysis is viewed in this sense as being increasingly robust. Additionally, as this study focused on the retail sector, there was a chance to select other cases with similar circumstances. As a result, it generates more thorough research for the application of theories and discoveries. Since tests were be conducted, it is essential that the examples be carefully chosen so that the analyst can predict outcomes by comparing outcomes across cases or distinguishing findings based on a theory (Campbell & Ahrens, 1998). In the study, Sapphire is Case A and Gul Ahmed is Case B.

Analysts have access to a wide range of resources and methods for putting together data. Since case study interviews are one of the most important tactics in order to gather information about people and their activities, interviews are one of the most important case study analysis tools (Silverman, 2010). It is shown as a verbal exchange, frequently close-up and personal, in which the asker seeks to elicit information, conviction, or a conclusion from the respondent. A few possible interview formats include open-ended, targeted, structured, and survey (Burns, 1997).

Key participants were requested to offer their knowledge, observations, or opinions regarding particular events at an open-ended meeting. They might offer suggestions or share information about specific events or happenings. They may also certify evidence obtained from various sources. However, a concentrated interview is employed when only a few quick questions and a short period of time are asked of the participant. This approach is frequently used to verify data obtained from another source. For this inquiry, semi-structured open-ended interviews were used.
Semi-structured open-ended interviews are essential to the research since they allow for a wide range of information and prevent answer preparation. The MpC and S-DL discussed in the remaining group of material on VCoC were made dependent on them, notwithstanding. While striving to reduce the tendency for participant responses to be biased, I was able to gather content-rich information by using fitting testing methods, follow-up questions, and interpretative queries.

Along with, four times, the process was repeated, each time with a one-month break. Three pilot interviews were conducted three times apiece to evaluate the applicability of our chosen research methodology. The pilots significantly improved the validity of our investigation by clearly differentiating and streamlining the muddled definitions of inquiries. The study's author was able to become accustomed to the meeting environment, identify and avoid common interviewing pitfalls, and identify successful examinations and follow-up inquiries that deepened the information. Finally, interview questions were developed by topically limiting pertinent VCoC components in light of our academic papers and pilot studies. I was able to address the MpC and S-DL included in the interview using the semi-structured open-ended interview questions.

Next, sampling technique was another task to do before the data collection begun. The convenience, quota, snowball, and judgement samples are all parts of the non-probability sampling technique. Random probability sampling, systematic testing, or stratified testing have not been used because it was implausible for the study's investigator to provide actors with the same chance of selection in relation to their extent across the entire population. Non-probability sampling was utilized in the study because a complete census of the population was not available. In theory, all actors might participate in the study, making it difficult to identify the right responders.

As a result, a convenience sample was used, involving the snowball sampling technique. The snowball sampling technique is utilized to collect data due to the distributed industry across the nation, specific respondents (managers and customers of FF), and resource limitations, such as time, money, and human resources. Only a small number of people were used in this technique, and they served as multipliers, asking other people to join the sample (Dencombe, 2007). Additionally, it had the advantage of quickness, but it also encouraged the proliferation of interviews because the multipliers served as a point of comparison for the investigator's credibility.

**SAMPLING FRAME**

Another word for clothing collections that are based on the most popular fashion trends is "FF" (Solomon & Rabolt, 2009). It appears that the fashion cycle is moving more quickly than at any other time in recent memory. The web, technological progress, and globalization are in control of the fast-paced new design industry, which later creates a new market and handles it in a way that is only slightly different from the conventional fashion industry (Liz & Gaynor, 2006). Although the notion of FF receives little scholarly attention, it is often covered in the business and design media. In light of these factors, the size of the global FF market may very well be broadly estimated. Whatever happens, FF won't be ignored again. In a similar vein, FF is the sampling frame. The FF brands selected for the study are Sapphire and Gul Ahmed.

**SAMPLE SIZE**

The directors, managers, and customers of the FF retail market served as the study's units of analysis. 38 people were surveyed for the sample size. “Company A” provided four directors and ten floor managers, with one female floor manager and all the other participants being men. Ten managers from “Company B” participated; four of them were female and the rest were men. Participants were all 14 female clients of FF. As a result, there were equally as many male and female participants, or 50% each.
ANALYSIS METHOD

It uses a thematic analysis method. The format of the interview questions was adapted from the surviving document. This hypothesis is demonstrated by the integration of VCoC with CCT and S-DL in FF Retail. In this way, both FF brands contributed to our understanding of this subject. For the sake of research, each interview was recorded and translated. Software called MAXQDA’20 was used to aid in the coding and review processes. Two different examination philosophies were chosen by the investigation's author. The information from the interview was initially broken down by a direct study of the content. The material from the interview was then assigned to the classification on a sentence level using a beginning coding approach.

The underlying coding was filled in as a starting point to look into the FF supervisors' and customers' perspectives on VCoC. The Gioia technique is the second component of the analysis (Gioia et al., 2013). In order to organize the combined components, develop significance from the information, and create first- and second-order classifications, the researcher pursued these methods. While the 2nd-order theme presents themes at a theoretical level, qualities, and the more prominent narration, the 1st-order categories faithfully adhere to witness terminology. It helped with answering the investigation's test question. The analysis procedure is summarized in the figure below.

ANALYSIS

In order for the interviews to fully comprehend the phenomenon and offer this study insightful information on the subject, they were selected based on their knowledge and current positions. Although the interviewees' identities will remain unknown to preserve their privacy, the interviews were videotaped and afterwards transcripted. The codes assigned to each interviewee and their fundamental profile are displayed in Table 3.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr no.</th>
<th>Code attributed</th>
<th>Company/customer</th>
<th>Brand code / Customer Gender</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Interview 1</td>
<td>Company</td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Interview</td>
<td>Company</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Interview 2</td>
<td>Company</td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Interview 3</td>
<td>Company</td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Interview 4</td>
<td>Company</td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Interview 5</td>
<td>Company</td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Interview 6</td>
<td>Company</td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Interview 7</td>
<td>Company</td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Interview 8</td>
<td>Company</td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Interview 9</td>
<td>Company</td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Interview 10</td>
<td>Company</td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Interview 11</td>
<td>Company</td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Interview 12</td>
<td>Company</td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Interview 13</td>
<td>Company</td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Interview 14</td>
<td>Company</td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Interview 15</td>
<td>Company</td>
<td>B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Interview 16</td>
<td>Company</td>
<td>B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>Interview 17</td>
<td>Company</td>
<td>B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>Interview 18</td>
<td>Company</td>
<td>B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>Interview 19</td>
<td>Company</td>
<td>B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>Interview 20</td>
<td>Company</td>
<td>B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>Interview 21</td>
<td>Company</td>
<td>B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>Interview 22</td>
<td>Company</td>
<td>B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>Interview 23</td>
<td>Company</td>
<td>B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>Interview 24</td>
<td>Company</td>
<td>B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>Interview 25</td>
<td>Customer</td>
<td>Female</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>Interview 26</td>
<td>Customer</td>
<td>Female</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>Interview 27</td>
<td>Customer</td>
<td>Female</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>Interview 28</td>
<td>Customer</td>
<td>Female</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>Interview 29</td>
<td>Customer</td>
<td>Female</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>Interview 30</td>
<td>Customer</td>
<td>Female</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The interviewees were required to respond to questions that the author had developed. The theories and concepts mentioned in the literature study served as the foundation for all of the questions. The translation, transcription, and compilation of every interview into one document. The MAXQDA system, a useful tool for qualitative analysis, will be used in this study's analysis of the interviews gathered: MAXQDA is a program created to help and facilitate mixed-methods, qualitative, and quantitative research initiatives. All types of data that can be electronically acquired, such as interviews, surveys, papers in (PDF) format, tables in (Excel or SPSS) formats, bibliographic data, images, videos, web pages, and even tweets, can be imported, organized, analyzed, visualized, and published using this tool. It is an all-in-one software for research and teaching purposes in a variety of disciplines thanks to its wide range of features, from transcribing to inferential statistical analysis.

CODING STANDARDS

The literature review served as the basis for the coding scheme development. In order to construct a specialized coding scheme to analyses the interviews at hand and find answers to the proposed study questions, codes were highlighted and narrowed down. In doing so, related sub codes were combined under the protection of a parent code. Resources as Actor, the parent code, is shown in the code system table below, along with all of its sub codes.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 2 Code System</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Resources</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Resources &gt; Hard Skills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Resources &gt; Soft skills</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

CODING OF DATA

A structured set of parent and subcodes were formalized after constructing the finalized coding scheme with the help of a literature review and by personally going through the interviews. The data was then coded, which was done by reading through all the transcripts of the interviews and looking for themes that could be matched to each created code.
CODE SEGMENT ANALYSIS

Data coding established a foundation for the study of the coded segments. Multiple MAXQDA technologies were employed in the research to aid in this process and provide answers to the research questions.

RQ: What are the types of resources that are part of Co-Created Retail Experience?

Interviews were carefully evaluated for consideration of any subjectively or objectively defined resources that the company/customers recognize as being essential for jointly developed retail experiences in order to address the research topic. In this exercise, a list of materials was compiled, labelled, and divided into categories for soft and hard skills. The table below demonstrates how themes from several interviews were chosen and assigned to a resource.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 3 Codes Assigned</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Resources &gt; Hard Skills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Resources &gt; Soft Skills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The frequency at which a resource, both soft and hard, is coded in the provided data is shown in the table below. It is clear from the table that soft skills are valued as being more important for a co-created retail experience.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 4 Resources Frequency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Resources</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Resources &gt; Hard Skills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Resources &gt; Soft skills</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**DISCUSSION**

Investigating the different types of resources that make up the co-created retail experience was the goal of the study topic. The co-created retail experience is the result of a collaborative approach that involves the integration of many resources. Co-created retail experiences commonly include the resources listed below. In this study, the resources were divided into two categories: hard skills and soft skills. This is displayed in the table below along with additional categories for the two resources' themes:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 5 Themes of Resources and Subthemes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Themes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hard Skills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Soft Skills

1. Selling
2. Vision
3. See the picture in long term
4. Innovative people
5. Adaptable
6. Fresh ideas, new way of doing things
7. Communication
8. Build relation
9. Judge the psychology of customer
10. Creating value
11. Experience to co-create value
12. Try to build a good relationship
13. Honesty and integrity

### HARD SKILLS

According to the interview results, hard skills have been graded occasionally, if not frequently enough (see Table 3). There are four sub themes related to the main theme of hard skills. They are availability of the stock and on logging it on e-live, smooth operations, marketing research, evaluation and comparison with other brands, and good understanding and knowledge about the products they are selling. According to the co-creation concept in retail, according to Latourrette (2022), customers should be involved in the development and distribution of goods and services. They went on to say that from this perspective, the management of e-commerce inventory and the availability of goods may be seen as hard skills that enable retailers to provide a positive shopping experience for customers. Retailers have long battled to find effective ways to reduce the number of times they run out of stock as well as the negative effects that stock outs have on both their customers and the business overall (Silva et al., 2023). A product that is “stocked out” cannot be purchased at the point of sale. According to earlier study by Peinkofer et al. (2022) there are important stock out impacts, such as consumer dissatisfaction and lost sales, as well as pertinent approaches to either prevent or decrease customers' unfavorable stock out reactions.

Next, in the retail sector, smooth operations refer to the effective and efficient management of all operational components of a firm, such as inventory management, supply chain management, and customer service. Giving clients a seamless purchasing experience is the aim, since this may boost customer satisfaction and loyalty and, subsequently, drive sales and financial gain for the business. Several authors highlight the importance of smooth operations as a group of hard skills for creating a co-created retail experience. Effective operations have an impact on customer happiness and loyalty, according to Riaz et al. (2021). An important category of hard talents that can help develop a co-created shopping experience is effective retail operations, it should be mentioned. Retailers can use technology to run their businesses more efficiently, which can increase customer satisfaction and loyalty, reduce costs, and lower costs. Having competent, well-trained employees who are familiar with the products and services they sell is essential for providing clients with a pleasant shopping experience.

Third, marketing research is necessary to completely understand client requirements and preferences and determine how successfully a store is meeting those demands (Bu et al., 2022). Bu et al. (2022) claim that by obtaining information on client feedback and behavior, businesses can improve their goods and services to better meet customer expectations. Retailers who wish to develop a co-created retail experience need to have a crucial set of hard skills in marketing analysis, evaluation, and comparison with other businesses. By researching customer needs and preferences, identifying market trends, and improving their goods and services to meet customer expectations
Lastly, having a thorough understanding of and competence in the products that a company sells is an essential category of hard skills for merchants looking to develop a co-created retail experience.

An essential component of a co-created workplace is improving the consumer experience. Employees that are informed about the products they are selling are better equipped to advice and counsel clients, according to Hilton et al.’s (2013) study. For merchants looking to create a co-created retail experience, having a thorough understanding of the products a business sells are a crucial category of hard skills. Retailers may increase consumer experiences, promote brand loyalty, increase sales, build brand reputation, and gain a competitive edge in order to grow their company.

**SOFT SKILLS**

According to interview results, soft skills were more frequently rated. Soft skills are increasingly important in retail, especially when it comes to value co-creation, as they are required for offering great customer service, according to a recent study by Alnakhli et al. (2021). Recent research has shown that strengthening customer relationships is essential for enhancing the retail sector’s value (Johnson et al., 2021). The analysis has disclosed thirteen sub themes. They are selling, vision, see the picture in long term, innovative people, adaptable, fresh ideas and new way of doing things, communication, build relation, judge the psychology of customer, creating value, experience to co-create value, try to build a good relationship, and honesty and integrity.

To begin with, selling is an essential component of soft skills that must be mastered in order to create a co-created retail experience. Selling a good or service requires developing a relationship with the customer (Johnson et al., 2021). Successful selling involves more than just closing a deal; it also involves building rapport with the customer. Retailers who prioritize building relationships with their customers will see increased customer loyalty and long-term sales (Shamim et al. 2023). A crucial component of soft skills, selling can be used to create a co-created buying experience. By building relationships with customers, understanding customer needs, upselling and cross-selling, providing a fantastic experience, and conveying value, retailers may increase revenue and grow their business.

Second, a distinct vision is necessary for a cohesive brand experience and image. In a co-created retail environment, customers are active creators of their own retail experiences rather than merely passive consumers of a company’s services (Cheng 2019). Consumers who believed their company had a compelling vision were more likely to display loyal and pro-brand behaviors, according to Gardiazabal and Bianchi (2021). Additionally, when customers believe their values coincide with the company’s mission, they are more inclined to participate in co-creation activities like providing feedback, suggesting new goods or services, or sharing their personal experiences with others. As a result, the company and its clients could gain from a sense of community and cooperation. Customers who believed that a company had a clear vision were more likely to take part in co-creation activities, according to a study by Hussain et al. published in 2021.

Further, another sub theme was seeing the big picture that can give advantage to co-created retail experiences. Businesses can better anticipate change and make adjustments as a result of having a broad perspective (Zhang et al., 2020). Businesses with a long-term perspective are better able to anticipate and react to changes in consumer behavior, technology, and the competitive environment in the continuously changing retail sector. Babu et al.’s (2020) study, for instance, found that companies with a long-term vision were more likely to engage in sustainability and innovation, which in turn enhanced financial success.

Fourth sub theme is success in the retail industry depends on innovation. Successful businesses set themselves apart from their rivals by having the ability to create and offer unique and original experiences. According to a study by Casagrande, G. (2022), businesses that continuously innovate
grow their sales and profits at a far faster rate than those who do not. Growth and profitability both depend on innovation. Innovative businesses also increase shareholder returns and profit margins. Customer loyalty is increased through innovation (Omar et al., 2021). According to a survey, customers are more likely to stick with establishments that offer unique and customized experiences. By creating novel and original experiences, retailers may distinguish themselves from their competitors and forge enduring bonds with their customers.

One of the most important soft skills in today’s rapidly changing workplace is adaptability. It suggests the ability to adapt to changing circumstances, take things up quickly, and change with the times. Flexibility is essential in the retail industry if you want to stay ahead of the competition and provide excellent customer service (Hamidi and Machold, 2020). The study makes the point that retailers must have a flexible organizational culture in order to respond quickly to changing consumer demands and preferences. Further, the ability to generate innovative ideas and approach challenges in novel ways is a crucial resource for co-created retail experiences. By embracing innovation and experimentation, creating unique and engaging experiences, and standing out from the competition, retailers can increase recurring business.

Seventh, effective communication is a key soft skill for the co-creation of a fantastic buying experience. Clear communication improves customer service. Retail employees that can converse well with customers are better equipped to understand their needs and preferences and provide happier, more individualized service (Alnakhli et al., 2021). Eighth, subtheme build relation refers to the practice of forging enduring connections with customers in the context of retail. Building relationships with customers while fostering trust and empathy is necessary for this skill, which could ultimately lead to increased sales and client loyalty.

Ninth, understanding and addressing the psychology of customers is a vital soft skill in the retail industry. By learning about their customers’ needs, wants, and preferences, retailers may provide a customized shopping experience that meets and exceeds their expectations. A personalized purchasing experience can lead to more satisfied, loyal, and spending customers. According to research by Deng et al. (2021), personalized shopping experiences have a positive effect on customer pleasure, trust, and loyalty. Tenth, the capacity to provide value through soft skills is a crucial resource for co-created retail experiences. In their interactions with customers, retailers who place a high value on empathy, communication, and problem-solving are more likely to deliver wonderful experiences, foster loyalty, and stand out in a crowded market. The ability of a sales associate to personalize a customer’s experience through effective communication and a genuine interest in their needs is closely related to how satisfied customers are with their shopping experience, according to Loiaet al., (2021).

Eleventh sub theme is a crucial soft skill for businesses that want to provide their customers personalized and customized experiences is the ability to co-create value. Collaboration with customers may enable businesses to develop original solutions that adjust to the changing needs and preferences of their target markets, thereby boosting customer satisfaction, brand loyalty, and financial success. Twelfth sub theme is to establish a co-created retail experience, it is essential to have integrity and honesty. They are crucial for creating a positive work environment, building a strong corporate culture, and winning over customers. Since they are crucial to the success of any retail company, honesty and integrity should be given high attention by retailers when employing and training employees.

Last sub theme is trying to build a good relation. Developing a good relation skill is essential in the retail industry, according to a growing body of research. Building strong emotional bonds with clients is a crucial element in encouraging customer loyalty, claims Indriastuti (2019). Businesses that prioritize building relationships with their customers are also more likely to experience repeat business and receive positive word-of-mouth recommendations. Additionally, research has shown
that customers who emotionally connect with a brand are more likely to make repeat purchases, refer the business to others, and overlook occasional service errors. Itani et al. (2022) found that customers who have an emotional connection to a brand are more than twice as likely to recommend it to others than customers who are just satisfied with their experience.

CONCLUSION

The CCT and the S-DL of marketing have been combined in this study to examine the difficulties of value co-creation in the retail industry. By combining these two theoretical stances, it was hoped to gain a fuller understanding of how merchants may successfully involve customers in co-creating value and encourage meaningful experiences. Throughout this research, we have examined the fundamental ideas of SDL, which emphasize the shift from a goods-dominant logic to a service-dominant logic. Through realizing that value is jointly created through interactions between customers and businesses, SDL emphasizes the need of collaboration and communication in understanding and meeting client requests.

This point of view places a strong emphasis on the ongoing relationship between companies and their clients, in which value is actively produced via the sharing of resources that are advantageous to both sides rather than merely being transferred through transactions. Two main themes were derived - hard skills and soft skills. Both the skills had sub themes under them. There are four sub themes related to the main theme of hard skills. They are availability of the stock and on logging it on e-live, smooth operations, marketing research, evaluation and comparison with other brands, and good understanding and knowledge about the products they are selling. Moreover, the examination has found thirteen sub themes under the main theme of soft skills. They are selling, vision, see the picture in long term, innovative people, adaptable, fresh ideas and new way of doing things, communication, build relation, judge the psychology of customer, creating value, experience to co-create value, try to build a good relationship, and honesty and integrity.

REFERENCES


